
CONTENTS

TABLE OF CASES	xix
PREFACE	xxvii
BOOK STRUCTURE	xxix
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 What is tax avoidance?	3
1.1.1 Irish Commission on Taxation in the 1980s	6
1.1.2 1955 UK Royal Commission	7
1.1.3 UK HMRC	10
1.1.4 Joseph Stiglitz - Economist	13
1.2 What “tax avoidance” is not?	14
1.3 The Courts’ view of tax avoidance	17
1.3.1 <i>Duke of Westminster v Commissioners</i> <i>of Inland Revenue</i>	18
1.3.2 <i>O’Sullivan v P Ltd</i>	19
1.3.3 <i>McGrath v MacDermott</i>	21
1.3.4 <i>O’Flynn Construction</i>	22
1.4 Doctrine of Certainty in Taxation	28
1.5 Economic position in 1989 when it was enacted	32
1.6 Constitutionality of s811	35
1.7 Conclusion	38
Appendix I - Extract from Explanatory Memorandum which accompanied s86 of FA 1989 (now consolidated as s811 TCA97)	39
Appendix II - The transaction in the <i>O’Flynn Construction</i> case	40
CHAPTER 2 STATUTORY INTERPRETATION AND THE RULE OF IRISH TAX LAW	41
2.1 Introduction	41
2.2 “Historic” methods in the interpretation for tax statutes	47
2.3 Reference made to the history or development of legislation at the Irish Supreme Court in <i>O’Flynn</i>	52
2.4 Purposive interpretation and tax statutes	57
2.4.1 Section 5 of the Interpretation Act	58
2.4.2 References to statutory interpretation in Irish Supreme Court decision in <i>O’Flynn</i> <i>Construction</i>	68

2.5	Reference to extraneous material in statutory interpretation	72
2.6	Legitimate expectation	74
2.7	Conclusion	78
CHAPTER 3 <i>McGrath's "IMPLICIT INVITATION"</i>		79
3.1	Introduction	79
3.2	Facts of the <i>McGrath</i> case	79
3.3	<i>McGrath's</i> "implicit" invitation	81
3.4	Form and substance in <i>McGrath</i>	83
3.5	The "sham" doctrine.....	88
3.6	Conclusion	93
CHAPTER 4 SECTION 811 - DEFINITIONS		95
4.1	Introduction	95
4.2	Definitions	95
4.2.1	"the Acts"	95
4.2.2	"business"	100
4.2.3	"notice of opinion"	105
4.2.4	"tax"	106
4.2.5	"tax advantage"	107
4.2.6	"tax avoidance transaction"	117
4.2.7	"tax consequences",	117
4.2.8	"transaction"	117
4.3	Conclusion	120
CHAPTER 5 MEANING OF "TAX AVOIDANCE TRANSACTION" AND ITS CONSEQUENCES		121
5.1	Introduction	121
5.2	Definition of "Tax avoidance transaction"	121
5.2.1	The ss2/ss3 "clash"	123
5.3	Subsection 2 - discussion.....	125
5.3.1	Primary purpose of a transaction	132
5.4	Subsection 3(a) - discussion	137
5.4.1	Business profits.....	138
5.4.2	Abuse/misuse of a relief.....	141
5.5	Subsection 3(b) - discussion	148
5.6	Purpose of a relief	152
5.7	Conclusion	155
Appendix I – Layout of s811(3) as discussed in the Supreme Court decision in <i>O'Flynn</i> <i>Construction Limited</i>		156

CHAPTER 6	REVENUE POWERS, FORMATION AND DELIVERY OF s811 OPINION.....	157
6.1	Introduction	157
6.2	Time limits for Revenue opinions - s811(4) and (5A), s811A(1A)	157
6.2.1	Section 811(4)	157
6.2.2	<i>Revenue Commissioners v Droog</i>	158
6.2.3	FA 2008 – insertion of s811A(1A)	160
6.2.4	FA 2012 – insertion of s811(5A)	163
6.2.5	Retrospective legislation and the Irish Constitution	166
6.3	Section 811(4) – contents of a s811 opinion.....	174
6.4	Section 811(5) – Revenue’s actions having formed an opinion under s811(2)/(3).....	176
6.4.1	Section 811(5)(e) – Revenue opinion becomes “final and conclusive”	176
6.4.2	Section 811(5)(a) – actions available to Revenue...	177
6.4.3	Section 811(5)(b) – detailed actions available to Revenue.....	180
6.5	Section 811(6) – Revenue communication with taxpayer.....	182
6.6	Conclusion	186
	Appendix I - Relevant elements of Part 41 discussed in <i>Droog</i>	187
CHAPTER 7	APPEALING PROVISIONS WITHIN s811	189
7.1	Introduction	189
7.2	Appealing a s811 opinion to the Appeal Commissioners...	190
7.3	Appealing a s811 opinion to the Higher Courts	195
7.4	Conclusion	196
CHAPTER 8	SECTION 811A.....	197
8.1	Introduction	197
8.2	Commencement provisions.....	198
8.3	“Charging” element of s811A.....	200
8.3.1	Section 811A(2) - surcharge and interest “charging” provision	200
8.3.2	Section 811A(3) - surcharge and interest “relieving” provision	204
8.3.3	Relevant date	205
8.4	Form of a Protective Notification – details to be contained therein.....	207

8.5	Is an expression of doubt a Protective Notification for s811A purposes?	208
8.6	2-year time limit on Revenue forming a "s811 opinion"	209
8.7	Appeal provisions.....	210
8.8	Conclusion	212
CHAPTER 9 THE CANADIAN GAAR.....		213
9.1	Introduction	213
9.2	Relevance of the decisions of Canadian Courts generally ...	214
9.3	Differences of approach to the interpretation of statutes and the burden of proof as to the purpose of an enactment	217
9.3.1	Burden of Proof	222
9.4	Whether Canadian GAAR having a universal acclaim?	223
9.5	A brief overview of Canadian caselaw referred to in <i>O'Flynn Construction</i>	226
9.5.1	<i>Canada Trustco</i>	226
9.5.2	<i>Mathew, Kaulius and Others v The Queen [Kaulius]</i>	234
9.5.3	Section 811 at the Canadian Court of Appeal on Balancing Allowances	235
9.6	Conclusion	236
Appendix I - Dissenting judgement in <i>O'Flynn Construction</i> re differences between s811 and Canadian GAAR		237
Appendix II - Canadian GAAR as cited in the case of <i>Trustco</i>		239
CHAPTER 10 THE EU AND ANTI-AVOIDANCE		241
10.1	Introduction	242
10.2	Recent developments in the EU on "aggressive tax planning"	242
10.2.1	Double Tax Treaty "extension"	244
10.2.2	General Anti-Abuse Rule (GAAbR)	245
10.2.3	"Arrangement"	247
10.2.4	"Artificial"	248
10.2.5	Essential purpose of avoiding tax.....	253
10.3	Approach of the CJEU on avoidance matters	259
10.3.1	Potential interaction of Case 1 and 2	259
10.3.2	Case 1 - Abuse of Rights and the CJEU - the "Halifax doctrine"	263
10.3.3	Penalties imposed where an abuse is present.....	271

10.3.4	Taxpayer choice of structuring business.....	272
10.3.5	Irish Courts' interpretation of the "abuse of law doctrine"	275
10.3.6	Case 2 - Infringement of fundamental freedoms where "wholly artificial arrangements" have been entered into	278
10.4	Conclusion	289
Appendix I - Council Directive of 24 June 1988 for the implementation of Article 67 of the Treaty (88/361/EEC)		290

**CHAPTER 11 THE AVOIDANCE CASELAW IN THE UK -
A CIRCULAR JOURNEY? AND S811 293**

11.1	Introduction	294
11.2	<i>Ramsay</i>	296
11.2.1	Facts of case - <i>Ramsay</i>	298
11.2.2	Analysis - <i>Ramsay</i>	299
11.2.3	Concluding remarks - <i>Ramsay</i>	308
11.3	<i>Burmah Oil</i>	308
11.3.1	Facts of case - <i>Burmah Oil</i>	309
11.3.2	Analysis - <i>Burmah Oil</i>	309
11.4	<i>Furniss v Dawson</i>	310
11.4.1	Facts of case - <i>Dawson</i>	311
11.4.2	Analysis - <i>Dawson</i>	312
11.5	<i>Craven v White</i>	318
11.5.1	Facts of case - <i>Craven</i>	318
11.5.2	Analysis - <i>Craven</i>	319
11.5.3	Concluding remarks - <i>Craven</i>	325
11.6	<i>McGuckian</i>	326
11.6.1	Facts of case - <i>McGuckian</i>	327
11.6.2	Analysis - <i>McGuckian</i>	328
11.6.3	Concluding remarks - <i>McGuckian</i>	328
11.7	<i>Westmoreland Investments Limited</i>	329
11.7.1	Facts of case - <i>Westmoreland</i>	329
11.7.2	Analysis - <i>Westmoreland</i>	330
11.7.3	Concluding remarks - <i>Westmoreland</i>	334
11.8	<i>BMBF</i>	335
11.8.1	Facts of case - <i>BMBF</i>	335
11.8.2	Analysis - <i>BMBF</i>	337
11.8.3	Concluding remarks - <i>BMBF</i>	338

11.9	<i>Tower M Cashback</i>	339
	11.9.1 Facts of case – <i>Tower</i>	339
	11.9.2 Analysis – <i>Tower</i>	340
11.10	<i>Mayes</i>	341
	11.10.1 Facts of case – <i>Mayes</i>	342
	11.10.2 Analysis – <i>Mayes</i>	343
	11.10.3 Concluding remarks – <i>Mayes</i>	345
11.11	And finally.....	345
CHAPTER 12 THE “GAAR” IN THE UK.....		347
12.1	Introduction.....	348
12.2	Commencement provisions.....	350
12.3	Brief overview.....	352
12.4	Definitions in the UK GAAR.....	353
	12.4.1 Taxes covered by the GAAR.....	354
	12.4.2 Tax arrangements.....	355
	12.4.3 Tax advantage.....	358
12.5	The “Abusive” test.....	361
	12.5.1 Double “reasonableness” test – “cannot reasonably be regarded”.....	362
	12.5.2 Double “reasonableness” test – “a reasonable course of action”.....	364
	12.5.3 Whether substantive results of the arrangements are consistent with principles and the policy objectives of relevant tax provisions.....	365
12.6	Indicators of abuse.....	368
12.7	Procedure to be followed by the HMRC.....	370
12.8	GAAR Advisory Panel.....	372
12.9	Counteraction.....	375
	12.9.1 UK Guidance on counteraction.....	377
	12.9.2 Consequential relieving provisions.....	379
12.10	Burden of proof.....	379
12.11	Conclusion.....	380
Appendix I – UK Finance Act 2013 provisions in connection with the GAAR.....		381
Appendix II – Members of GAAR Advisory Panel at time of writing.....		391
Appendix III – Discussion and overview of Aaronson report.....		392
Index	401